

## **Cleveland Community Police Commission**

### **Full Commission Meeting Minutes**



Regularly Scheduled Meeting

Special Meeting

Meeting Date: February 28, 2024

Meeting Time: 6:00 PM

Meeting Location: Cleveland Community Police Commission Offices,  
3631 Perkins Avenue, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor, Cleveland, OH 44114

This regular meeting of the Cleveland Community Police Commission was called to order on February 28 at 6:05 by Co-chair Zayed.

#### **Attendance Roll Call:**

- Adams – present
- Benito – present
- Chura – Present
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – excused absence
- Garrett-Ferguson – Present
- Kennedy – Present
- Reaves – Present
- Ridgeway – Present
- Rodriguez – Present
- van Lier – Present
- Wang – Present
- Zayed – Present

#### **Quorum established: yes.**

Benito moved to move the public comment period to after the Committee Reports, Reaves seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – nay
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – nay
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – abstain

- van Lier – aye
- Wang – nay
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passed, 8-2-1.**

Wang moved to reorder the discussion of motions, Chura seconded.

- Adams – nay
- Benito – nay
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – nay
- Reaves – nay
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – nay
- van Lier – nay
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – nay

**Motion fails, 4-7-0.**

Benito moved to add motions concerning Opening an OPS Complaint Review, Police Personnel, and amend a previous GPO motion from the Policy Committee to New Business, Chura Seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

Wang moved to amend the agenda to move up the three motions listed in Old Business, the ones concerning the Removal of a Committee Chair, Recommendation for the Removal of a Commissioner, and to Enter into Executive Session to Discuss the Discipline of a Public Official, to be the next items for consideration, seconded.

Garrett-Ferguson offered a friendly amendment to Wang's amendment to the agenda to move the motions to after the committee reports, Earley seconded.

On the friendly amendment:

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Friendly amendment passes, 11-0-0.**

Updated agenda is adopted by unanimous consent.

Adopting the Meeting Minutes from the January Full Commission Meeting

Benito moved to adopt the Minutes, Reaves seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

#### Co-chair Report

- The Co-chairs met with the Monitoring Team concerning delayed records request and the delay with CPRB manual, as well as some of the challenges with the grants, and concerns about staffing. They also spoke about which sections of the Consent Decree that should be prioritized.
- The City acknowledged their error in not involving the Commission in the hiring process for the hiring/promotion for the Forth District Commander. The Commission and the community will now be involved in that process.
- The Co-chairs, working with the Interim ED, have proposed the idea of having two Executive Committees, with the Co-chairs and the Committee Chairs. One would focus on issues related to policing and the other to CPC's administrative functions.

Benito Moved to form the Police Executive Committee and the Administrative Executive Committee, Kennedy seconded.

Kennedy moved to add a friendly amendment to Benito's motion to clarify that these Executive Committees does not have voting power on their own, Garrett-Ferguson seconded.

Wang moved to add a friendly amendment to Benito's motion to have these meetings in public, Garrett Ferguson seconded.

On Wang's friendly amendment:

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Friendly amendment passes, 11-0-0.**

On Kennedy's friendly amendment:

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Friendly amendment passes, 11-0-0.**

On Benito's motion:

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

### **Director's Report (Interim Executive Director Goodrick)**

- IED and the Co-chairs attended the Cleveland City Council Budget Committee Hearing, while the Committee has not yet voted, they seemed skeptical of the Commission's budget requests.
- There are six outstanding records requests, and the CPC is filing for relief in Federal Court. The City argued in a motion to the court that the delay is because of the volume of the records requested. The City also argued that they do not have to share some of the records because they contain LEADS data. The DOJ

will most likely introduce a motion that says they are opposed to the City's motion.

- The job opening for the Senior Communications Specialist closed on February 16; there were 20 applicants. Zayed will be the commissioner who will sit on the hiring committee.

## **Committee Reports**

### Accountability (Wang):

- The Rubric for the Brady-Giglio List and the first revision of the Manual of Rules were finalized. Now work is being done on the Discipline Charts.
- The Committee received its first two appeal cases, CPC 2023-001 and CPC 2024-001.

There was an extensive back and forth concerning how these cases will be handled. It at times became intense.

### Budget and Grants (Garrett-Ferguson):

- The Committee is reviewing the Grant application process, hoping to make it more user-friendly and streamlined.
- We are looking at possibly working through another organization to help us distribute grants.

### Policy (van Lier):

- Technology WG is reviewing the proposed ShotSpotter GPO and looking into establishing policies concerning the FUSUS, a surveillance system.
- The Committee is also looking at reviewing PTSD protocol.
- The Policy Committee is looking to establish a technology committee between the City and the Commission. Commissioners Garrett-Ferguson and Wang will serve on it
- A Work Group has been established to look into vehicle pursuits.

van Lier moved to adopt the Preclearance Procedures concerning GPOs, Benito seconded.

Garrett-Ferguson moved to add a friendly amendment to the motion to not require prior approval for internal restructuring within the Division, Bennito seconded.

Wan moved to delay voting on the motion; it was not seconded.

On Garrett-Ferguson's friendly amendment:

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – no
- van Lier – no
- Wang – abstain
- Zayed – abstain

### **Motion passes, 7-2-2.**

On van Lier's motion:

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

### **Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

Rules (van Lier, Pro tem)

- The Committee is still working on Section 1.4.5 of the CPC's Manual.

Van Lier moved to adopt the revision of Section 1.4.4, which means Co-chairs will fill temporary vacancies on committees, Kennedy and Benito seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave

- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

Outreach (Kennedy, Pro tem)

- The Committee does not have a quorum yet, so no actions have been taken since the last meeting.
- Update form the IED about the RFQ process: *the RFQ was sent over to purchasing, one of the questions was do we have a preconference to shorten this process if we need to, and we are waiting for their response. Once we receive it we will set up a committee to get the survey out.*
- Working on a project to reach out to all of the wards.

Training (Benito, Pro tem)

- Some community members have volunteered to help with reviewing training materials.
- The Committee is working out a process on how training will be approved. The DOJ also comments on these processes, so we are figuring out how best to work with all of the parties involved.

Benito moved to adopt the trainings concerning Firearms Requalification, as are required by law in the State of Ohio, Kennedy seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye



- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

Benito moved to approve the ABLE/Bystander Training Lesson Plans, Adams seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

Co-chair Adams moved to extend the extend the meeting by 30 minutes.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – abstain
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – no
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 9-1-1.**

**Old Business**

van Lier withdrew two of the motions listed under Old Business, the Removal of a Committee Chair and Recommendation for the Removal of a Commissioner.

**Those motions are withdrawn.**

Van Lier withdrew the motion to Enter into Executive Session to Discuss the Discipline of a Public Official, also listed under Old Business.

**That motion was withdrawn.**

Benito moved to accept the following resignations; Kennedy seconded:

- Reaves from Police Training
- Earley from Outreach
- Benito from Accountability
- Garret-Ferguson from Outreach

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

Ridgeway moved to accept the following committee appointments; Adams seconded:

- Rodriguez to join Training and Outreach
- Garrett-Ferguson to join Accountability
- Note: that Ridgeway is going on a Leave of Absence, but will be joining the Vehicle Pursuit WG in the meantime.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye

- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

Garret-Ferguson moved to reopen the Hiring Committee to search for a permanent Executive Director, Kennedy seconds.

Benito made a friendly amendment to the motion to note that the Hiring Committee will include Commissioners Benito, Reaves, Chura, van Lier seconded.

Rodriguez made a friendly amendment to the friendly amendment to also include Commissioners Rodriguez and Wang on the Hiring Committee, Garrett-Ferguson seconded.

On Rodriguez's friendly amendment:

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – abstain
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – nay

**Friendly amendment passes, 9-1-1.**

On Benito's friendly amendment:

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye

- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – abstain
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 10-0-1.**

On Garrett-Ferguson's motion:

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – on leave
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – aye
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – aye
- Ridgeway – aye
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

**Motion passes, 11-0-0.**

**Public Comment**

- Linda Rico, Cleveland resident, Brady-Giglio WG member, said that the BG WG has been very productive in its work. Unfortunately, she does not have a lot of hope for collaboration with the Police, given how uncooperative they have been with records request to oversight in general, and the BG WG in particular. She suggested that Commissioner Wang should not be removed, and that she is a capable WG leader. She expressed hope that the infighting within the Commission would stop.
- Cameron Denassa, Cleveland resident, seconded the previous comment that Wang should stay on, noting she does good work in committees. He expressed disappointment with the Full meeting so far, including how long the public comment section was delayed. He also mentioned concerns he has with policing in Cleveland including the violation of Black citizens' gun rights and the officer shortage.
- Loh expressed concern that CPC meetings are being poorly run. Loh expressed that she also felt that Wang was doing a good job.
- Councilwoman Stephanie House reiterated her comments from the City Council Budget Committee meeting expressing her dissatisfaction with the Commission's work so far,

and that the meetings have been poorly run. She suggested that the Commissioners work on team building and maybe even go on a retreat to do so.

- Delante Spencer Thomas, Chief Ethics Officer, wanted to point out that Executive Committees are formal public bodies; this means the Open Meetings Act applies to them, so the meetings must be public and with notice. He suggested that commissioners work with Martin Bielat (CPC staff attorney) to develop a process to take in cases and how to talk and how to not talk about these cases so you do not prejudice the case. want to talk about them publicly. He wanted to make sure the Commission is getting credit where credit is due. He said that there have been many valid criticisms of the Commission, but that not all were. He said that because the Commission had the responsibility of building a system from scratch, it is understandable that it took a long time to take cases. He also said that there has been a lot of other good work done.
- Chris Martin said that none of the Commissioners are using the rules of order properly and are instead using them as a cudgel against each other.
- Kayla Pincus, former Discipline WG member, said that she worked with Commissioner Wang extensively during 2023 and often agreed with her on content and thinks she is an asset for the commission. However, she said that Wang behaves in an inappropriate and disrespectful way and that she is often out of order. She said that Commissioners need to keep each other in line, to harness your abilities. This public comment, while important, does not reflect the community's voices.
- Richard Jackson, former CPC Co-chair, expressed happiness with the progress that is being made, including establishing Executive Committees. He expressed concern that the division of the workload is inefficient and it is slowing down the work, and he hopes that the ECs would help with that. He emphasized the important role the Commission has in getting the City into compliance with the Consent Decree.
- Gabe Flores acknowledged the hard work the Commission is doing. However, he expressed concern with the internal dynamics between commissioners, suggesting they look into communication science programs to help work on improving that dynamic. He said that there does not need to be so much animosity within the Commission.
- Rosie Palfy, former MHRAC member, agrees with what has already been said about Commissioner Wang. She did want to note that Wang has done a 180 on many of the issues that were debated tonight. She also expressed concerns about how the staff is being treated. She also expressed concerns about the Commission taking up five year old cases that were ruled to be unfounded.

**Reaves moved to adjourn, with unanimous consent.**

**Meeting adjourned at 9:03.**