


**CLEVELAND
COMMUNITY
POLICE
COMMISSION**

 3631 Perkins Ave.
4th Floor
Cleveland, Ohio 44114

 216-505-5920

 www.clecpc.org

 info@clecpc.org

Commissioners

Ms. Jan Ridgeway
(Co-Chair)

Ms. Audrianna Rodriguez
(Co-Chair)

Dr. John Adams

Ms. Shandra Benito

Mr. James Chura

Mr. Charles Donaldson

Mr. Kyle Earley

Ms. Alan Garrett-Ferguson

Ms. Cait Kennedy

Mr. Gregory Reaves

Mr. Piet van Lier

Ms. Teri Wang

Ms. Sharena Zayed

Interim Executive Director

Mr. Jason Goodrick

May 8, 2023

Dr. Leigh Anderson
Executive Director
Police Accountability Team
Cleveland, Ohio

Via Email

Dr. Anderson,

Please find attached the feedback from our special Community Police Commission meeting on May 3rd regarding the City's finalist for the Public Safety Inspector General Position.

Nine Commissioners provided feedback on the candidate, Mr. Macdonald A.P. Muir. The overwhelming majority (seven of nine) of the Commissioners who responded support the hiring of Mr. Muir. Commissioners in support felt Mr. Muir was professional, answered questions appropriately, and is qualified for the position. They appreciated his mention of collaborative approaches to his work. Additionally, they appreciated Mr. Muir's acknowledgement of the learning curve that will exist if he is selected for the position. One commissioner abstained from making a recommendation but did provide feedback.

Concerns that were raised regarding Mr. Muir's candidacy included the lack of specific knowledge related to Cleveland and Mr. Muir's overall commitment to the job long term. One commissioner recommended passing on Mr. Muir and believes the hiring process was in violation of both the Consent Decree and Charter Section 115-5.

Unfortunately there was very little participation from community members. There is not enough data to support any collective viewpoints from the community on Mr. Muir.

All feedback is attached to this letter. It is our hope that you and everyone involved in the selection process will thoroughly review each Commissioner's feedback. Thank you and others at the City for working to ensure this special meeting was possible on short notice. We look forward to hearing the City's final decision on Mr. Muir.

Regards,

Charles Donaldson
Commissioner, Cleveland Community Police Commission
Chair, Hiring Committee



Public Safety Inspector General - Community Police Commission Interview

Candidate: Mac Muir

May 3, 2023

5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.

Commissioner: Dr. John Adams

Please list the Candidate's strengths.

I was impressed by Mr. Muir's broad knowledge base across many subject areas. He seemed highly aware of the nuances involved in the breadth of the work with which the Inspector General will be tasked. His leadership style appears open and collaborative, which will be of great benefit to the overall efforts to reform the Cleveland Division of Police. Mr. Muir's diversity in his previous employment experiences is another strength because it allows him to view complex, sometimes opaque, issues from various perspectives. Lastly, the candidate expressed his willingness to learn new things and be open to making the necessary adjustments to ensure the position's success.

Please list the Candidate's weaknesses.

Although he is familiar with the city, I do have some concern regarding the candidate's knowledge about the city of Cleveland. He appears familiar with some areas and communities, but not others. It is my hope that he will spend time in all areas of the city to enhance his foundation for the challenging work that awaits him. I was also concerned about Mr. Muir's explanation about cultural competence. I may even suggest some extra support in training around this area. Lastly, while I appreciate Mr. Muir's respect from the Monitoring team, once Cleveland is out of the consent decree, he will not be able to rely on them. I hope that the candidate learns what he needs to and develops his own leadership style and independence.

Please note how the Candidate's professional qualities **will or will not** serve them well in the execution of the duties of Public Safety Inspector General for the City of Cleveland.

I found Mr. Muir to be qualified and highly professional. His experience, open-mindedness and strong communication skills will be of great service to the people of Cleveland and an asset to meeting the requirements of the consent decree. For these reasons, I recommend that the City of Cleveland hire Mr. Muir as the next Public Safety Inspector General.



Public Safety Inspector General - Community Police Commission Interview

Candidate: Mac Muir

May 3, 2023

5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.

Commissioner: Jan Ridgeway

Please list the Candidate's strengths.

Community focus! on par with Collaboration! Outreach to and input from diverse communities; value of community input; understands real and perceived sense of equity; recognizes public access challenges, even those unsubstantiated; welcomes feedback and collaboration with the CPC; understands that his success depends on working proactively with all of us charged with court compliance and police reform. Knowledge of emerging technology. Active in professional orgs.

Please list the Candidate's weaknesses.

Hiring is a process. A single one hour interview cannot result in a fair assessment. A performance task (writing proficiency) or a real time exercise (presentation or analytical demo) would've allowed for a more informed assessment. Obvious weaknesses were w/i the CPC: lack of experience interviewing; inappropriate and burdensome questions, questionable interview culture, the need for established interview procedures that are based on best practices and standards and that can withstand a possible legal challenge. First time; better next time.

Please note how the Candidate's professional qualities **will or will not** serve them well in the execution of the duties of Public Safety Inspector General for the City of Cleveland.

Will serve in execution of duties: familiarity with our City; a realistic approach to learning who and what has shaped our CPD officers; understands need for clear survey systems that welcome "bad" and good feedback; experience building culture w/i an organization; understands statistical disparities; knows that there will be a learning curve coming in and expressed a "fire" for new learning. Ultimate test: on the job probationary period. Time to show what you know.

Recommendation: YES HIRE



Public Safety Inspector General - Community Police Commission Interview

Candidate: Mac Muir

May 3, 2023

5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.

Commissioner: Audrianna Rodriguez

Please list the Candidate's strengths.

1.) Strong experience working with civilian oversight boards. During the interview he mentioned, being a supervisor for the New York Civilian board which consisted of 5-7 investigators and worked with 77 precincts of the NYPD.

2.) Willingness to work with various stakeholders to create solutions. His professional experience illustrates this

a.) Governor John Hickenlooper of Colorado to address police policy.

b.) Served as a subject matter expert for the Oakland police commission and draft procedures.

c.) Worked with the NY Civilian review board to gather statistics in aims to create reports & work with key stakeholders to create policies. Created Monthly Case workshops to help identify trends and to create solutions that address the investigative process such as timeliness, eliminate solos, share research practices, etc. Committee for Agency practices which proposed policy to executive director.

d.) NACOLE involvement which can serve as a resource to implement best practices from various cities and stay current on research studies. Member of the following NACOLE committees- Communications, investigations, stakeholders (Community Outreach), policy.

3.) Street Law which is the field of advancing civic and law-related education to empower all people to positively transform their world. I think this foundation will be essential to ensuring community voices and various stakeholders are involved in creating change and developing culture.

Please list the Candidate's weaknesses.

Statics & Metrics which can be addressed with the assistance from Data Analysis and Collection Coordinator outlined in the consent decree. (Data Collection and Analysis, page 61, paragraph 261)

The Data Analysis and Collection coordinator will be responsible for the routine reporting of relevant data to the chief of police, FRB, Training Review Committee, OPS, the commission, and the police inspector general now "public safety" inspector general.

Extensive knowledge in civilian oversight and has not had the opportunity to serve within this role. I believe that Dr. Anderson's experience with the Office of Inspector general with cities such as D.C, Chicago, teaching experiences at the Association of Inspector Generals will help to cultivate this role and serve as a professional step in his career. Additionally the previous Inspector, General Christopher Paul Viland, now serving Superintendent of Internal Affairs can serve as a resource.

Please note how the Candidate's professional qualities **will or will not** serve them well in the execution of the duties of Public Safety Inspector General for the City of Cleveland.

In addition to the reasons listed above, I am in support of hiring Candidate for the following reasons.

1.) He understands that importance of Equity, Efficiency, Effectiveness & Economy. In the interview he stated the following:

Equity- diagnosing problems within policing investigations and practices reveal unequal treatment. Constitutional policing ensures reverence for life, dignity, and human rights of all persons regardless of race, ethnicity, identity, or economic status, etc.

Efficiency & effectiveness. Time and money is precious. He has the skills to ensure high quality investigations in a timely fashion.

Economy- working in partnership to address public safety. (The items above are paraphrased from his Zoom interview)

2.) Action oriented- during the interview he proposed a possible technology called Trulio to increase accuracy and timeliness of cases based on the Aurora Colorado board.

I believe that the candidate will be an asset to the City of Cleveland and we have an opportunity to develop a young professional to make tremendous impact in the field of Police Reform. Thank you for taking the time to interview with the Cleveland Community Police Commission for the Public Safety Inspector General position. If you are selected as the candidate for the position, may you charge with tenacity, steadfastness, and convention in creating a safer Cleveland. Yes, for the city's selection of the candidate.



Public Safety Inspector General - Community Police Commission Interview

Candidate: Mac Muir

May 3, 2023

5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.

Commissioner: Charles Donaldson, Jr.

Please list the Candidate's strengths.

- Supervising Investigator experience with the Civilian Complaint Review Board for the City of New York.
- created monthly case workshop intended to look for trends within cases, establish effective policies, and produce higher quality of investigations.
- Mr. Muir stated that he handled 100+ investigations at any given time, which included high profile cases within 77 NYPD precincts.
- Awareness of disparities; throughout the interview, Mr. Muir seemed to have an understanding of disparities that exist within society and organizations. Mr. Muir mentioned using statistics to identify/define compartmental disparities and to diagnose racial disparities.
- Writing skills; Mr. Muir stated that he has thorough report writing experience which he gained throughout his career.

Please list the Candidate's weaknesses.

- Limited experience with Fire, Emergency Medical Services (EMS), Animal Care & Control (AC&C), and Corrections; Mr. Muir mentioned during the interview that these areas would be a learning experience for him.
- Independence; one of the responsibilities of an Inspector General is to maintain independence. However, several times throughout his interview, Mr. Muir mentioned collaborating with the monitoring team, OPS, and etc. This caused me to question his ability to effectively maintain a between independence and collaborating with others when making decisions.

Please note how the Candidate's professional qualities **will or will not** serve them well in the execution of the duties of Public Safety Inspector General for the City of Cleveland.

In my opinion, Mr. Muir's qualities will serve him well if he is selected for the City of Cleveland's Public Safety Inspector General position. I believe Mr. Muir was thoughtful with his responses to questions from the commissioners and he sought clarity when needed. Additionally, I believe Mr. Muir's ideas regarding community engagement/outreach align with what will be required for the role (i.e. working nights/weekends, asking community members for their ideas on where he should focus his engagement efforts, and learning more about the personal stories of both police officers and community members). Mr. Muir acknowledged that if he is selected for the role, there will be a learning curve for him in regards to some of the responsibilities. However, I believe Mr. Muir has the experiences, skills, and motivation necessary for success and I would recommend Mr. Muir for the Public Safety Inspector General position.

Donaldson, Charles (CPC)

From: Chura, James (CPC)
Sent: Monday, May 8, 2023 7:06 AM
To: Goodrick, Jason (CPC)
Cc: Donaldson, Charles (CPC)
Subject: Public Safety Inspector General

Jason,

I cannot email you a completed evaluation form. It comes up blank.

Mr. Muir's strengths appear to be his experience in public safety investigations and a collaborative approach to data analysis.

Since he is the only candidate for the job I would recommend approval of his appointment to the position.

Sincerely,

Commissioner James M. Chura



Public Safety Inspector General - Community Police Commission Interview

Candidate: Mac Muir

May 3, 2023

5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.

Cait Kennedy

Commissioner: _____

Please list the Candidate's strengths.

The candidate has relevant experience in policing & investigations. They also have experience in diverse regions of the country. The candidate performed well during the interview.

Please list the Candidate's weaknesses.

The candidate did not appear to have substantial knowledge of local issues & dynamics.

Please note how the Candidate's professional qualities **will or will not** serve them well in the execution of the duties of Public Safety Inspector General for the City of Cleveland.

The candidate would be able to start the work right away. They would have a learning curve as it relates to local issues & dynamics. I recommend this hire.



Public Safety Inspector General - Community Police Commission Interview

Candidate: Mac Muir

May 3, 2023

5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.

Commissioner: Shandra Benito

Please list the Candidate's strengths.

1. Candidates extensive experience with police misconduct investigations.
2. Candidates leadership in NACOLE and focus on professional standards and national trends
3. Candidates self awareness about the areas they will need to learn more about

Please list the Candidate's weaknesses.

1. Not a lot of experience in IG role
2. Lack of experience with EMS/Fire oversight

Please note how the Candidate's professional qualities **will or will not** serve them well in the execution of the duties of Public Safety Inspector General for the City of Cleveland.

I think the candidate seems like a good fit for the position, I think they are newer to this level of leadership, but I believe the candidate will work hard and learn what he needs to succeed. His leadership in NACOLE and the way he appears to go above and beyond in his position and be involved in the field at a national level makes me think that he is very dedicated to the field and will bring that to the position. I would recommend him for the position.



Public Safety Inspector General - Community Police Commission Interview

Candidate: Mac Muir

May 3, 2023

5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.

Commissioner: Piet van Lier

Please list the Candidate's strengths.

- substantial experience with police investigation and oversight
- clear understanding of the need for collaboration
- strong interview in terms of his ability to speak clearly and with knowledge
- awareness of job focus, limits
- coming from outside could a strength, clean slate and can build relationships

Please list the Candidate's weaknesses.

- more likely a liability that he is coming in from outside and doesn't know much about Cleveland (attending Oberlin does not seem that relevant)
- declined to talk about specifics when asked for examples, citing (perhaps not entirely unreasonably) confidential nature of the work. but he could have spoken without too much detail about some examples
- is clearly looking nationally for jobs in police investigation/oversight - his true interest in Cleveland is not clear - how long will he really last?

Please note how the Candidate's professional qualities **will or will not** serve them well in the execution of the duties of Public Safety Inspector General for the City of Cleveland.

His greatest strength, aside from relevant experience, is that he seems to be aware of the need to collaborate, build consensus. His resume also compares favorably with the other finalists. Otherwise, please see my comments about strengths/weaknesses noted above.

I am not entirely comfortable saying whether or not I recommend Mac Muir as a candidate for public safety IG, since I have not participated in other interviews, and thus lack a direct comparison. He definitely has some strengths and has qualifications and experience that work in his favor, but his commitment to and knowledge of Cleveland are not clear.



Public Safety Inspector General - Community Police Commission Interview

Candidate: Mac Muir

May 3, 2023

5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.

Commissioner: Teri Wang

Please list the Candidate's strengths.

Recommendation: NO.

Please see attached feedback narrative.

Please list the Candidate's weaknesses.

Please see attached.

Please note how the Candidate's professional qualities **will or will not** serve them well in the execution of the duties of Public Safety Inspector General for the City of Cleveland.

Please see attached.

CPC Commissioner Teri Wang
Mac Muir PSIG Interview Feedback

Recommendation: No.

I do not recommend hiring Mr. Mac Muir because the City's job description for Public Safety Inspector General (PSIG) does not match the job description for Inspector General (IG) outlined in both the Consent Decree and the Amended Consent Decree. These discrepancies specifically include but are not limited to: paragraph 253 subsections A, F, H; as well as paragraph 254.

Reviewing these discrepancies, we can see that the PSIG position represents a dilution of the responsibilities, power, and independence of the IG position as outlined in the Consent Decree. A reduction in the salary range/band for the PSIG position—even though the PSIG will oversee 5 city divisions (Police, Fire, EMS, Animal Control, and Corrections)—also supports this conclusion.

Additionally, the City's PSIG job description obscures and dilutes the IG's specific CDP responsibilities, as outlined in the Consent Decree, by nesting and including these job responsibilities under the broader banner of the aforementioned 5 city divisions.

Paragraph 250 of the Consent Decree states that "the City will seek the Commission's input in developing the minimum qualifications and experience for an Inspector General." To the best of my knowledge, the City did not seek CPC's input on the development of the minimum qualifications and experience for the PSIG position. Indeed, the CPC was not engaged until after the City had posted the PSIG position, solicited applications, and selected candidates for interview. This was done even though Charter 115-5 mandates that the CPC will "[interview and recommend] candidates for police commander and inspector general to the Mayor."

Indeed, it would appear that the City, without input from the CPC, finalized the PSIG job description, solicited applications, winnowed down the applicant pool, and only brought forward a single candidate (Mr. Muir) for interview with the CPC.

I have additional concerns about Mr. Muir as a candidate including his clarity of communication, understanding of statistics, and analytical rigor as demonstrated by his interview with the CPC. I believe these skills are essential to his ability to successfully serve as PSIG and/or IG.

For the reasons stated above, I do not recommend the hiring of Mr. Muir and request that the City engage with the CPC to identify a more suitable candidate as well as revise the PSIG job description to better comport with the Consent Decree.