

Cleveland Community Police Commission

Full Commission Meeting Minutes



Regularly Scheduled Meeting

Special Meeting

Meeting Date: May 22, 2024

Meeting Time: 6:00 PM

Meeting Location: Lonnie L. Burten Recreation Center,
2511 E46th Street, Cleveland, OH 44104

This regular meeting of the Cleveland Community Police Commission was called to order on May 22 at 6:08, by Co-chair Zayed.

Attendance Roll Call:

- Adams – present
- Benito – present
- Chura – present
- Donaldson – present
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – on-leave
- Kennedy – present
- Reaves – absent – excused
- Ridgeway – on-leave
- Rodriguez – present
- van Lier – present
- Wang – present
- Zayed – present

Wang moved to reorder the agenda; there was no second; the motion died.

Wang moved to move the motion concerning the Tolbert case to Old Business, Chura seconded.

- **Adams – nay**
- **Benito – nay**
- **Chura – nay**
- **Donaldson – nay**
- **Earley – absent**
- **Garrett-Ferguson – absent**
- **Kennedy – nay**
- **Reaves – absent**
- **Ridgeway – absent**
- **Rodriguez – nay**

- van Lier – nay
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – nay

The motion failed, 1-8-0.

Wang moved to reorder the agenda, Chura seconded.

- Adams – nay
- Benito – nay
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – nay
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – absent
- Kennedy – nay
- Reaves – absent
- Ridgeway – absent
- Rodriguez – nay
- van Lier – nay
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – nay

The motion failed, 2-7-0.

Benito moved to adopt the agenda as is, Kennedy seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – aye
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – absent
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – absent
- Ridgeway – absent
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – aye

The motion passed, 9-0-0.

Zayed moved to limit and commissioner's speaking time to one two minute comment per discussion, Benito second.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – aye
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – absent
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – absent
- Ridgeway – absent
- Rodriguez – no
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – no
- Zayed – aye

The motion passed, 7-2-0.

Wang moved to delay the adoption of the minutes and to set a policy for a two-week turnaround time for minutes, Rodriguez seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – aye
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – absent
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – absent
- Ridgeway – absent
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – aye
- Zayed – nay

The motion passed, 8-1-0.

Public Comment

Brenda Bickerstaff expressed frustration with the progress of work of the Commission, she also noted that there are those who are waiting for the CPC to make mistakes. She mentioned that many of the people who supported Issue 24 (the ballot initiative that established the present version of the CPC) are also disappointed with the progress the Commission has made.

Sabrina Otis seconded Ms. Bickerstaff's sentiment, noting how she had rallied others to support Issue 24 and was disappointed by the commissioners' infighting.

Cameron Demasca commented that Commissioner Wang should not be censured or removed from her committee assignments.

Loh also noted the challenges facing the Commission, but she said that these were not Commissioner Wang's fault, and that people can still get along despite the differences.

Daryl Houston expressed frustration with the Commission, noting how the conflict has caused it to become ineffective.

Rosie Palfy spoke about her experience giving testimony in an executive session of the Ad-Hoc Committee; she noted that during that meeting Commissioner Wang's behavior during that meeting was aggressive and threatening.

Co-chair Report (Co-chair Adams)

The CPC is trying to get direct access to police records via IA Pro. The CPC met with DOJ, concerning these records and there are records are still incoming records.

CPC staff is in the process of reviewing information from the Tolbert case (CPC2024-001).

Interim Executive Director Report

A midyear line-item budget will be presented at the June Budget and Grants Committee meeting.

The CPC is still down two staff members, through presently an offer was made for a Communications Specialist on staff; they are presently going through a background check. There is still an opening for Community Engagement Coordinator. It is an entry level position.

The City has changed its position regarding records requests, with CPC and OPS being considered law enforcement entities and would then have direct access to CDP records. Should the State of Ohio agree, the CPC will have access to these records directly.

The Co-chairs have been pushing hard for access, and Chief Todd seems to agree that the CPC should have more access. Individual records requests are moving forward, the City has not filed new objections in court against such requests. The Co-chairs meet with stakeholders from the DOJ and the Monitoring Team every Friday. Presently, the oldest outstanding request is from last July.

The CPC requested the information of all CDP officers who are named in lawsuits, those records are still outstanding; the City has not set up the process yet to collect that information. The city has not yet responded to the CPC's request for Bravos (Critical Incident) information.

The CPC did receive nearly all the files regarding OPS 22-0116, records came on Wednesday, and staff is currently sorting it out. The Safety Director's departure letter was not in the file packet and a request has been sent for it. The CPC is in the process of creating a process to hear cases.

Committee Status Reports

Police Accountability (Wang)

There was extensive discussion about records requests.

Budget and Grants (Kennedy)

The committee had approved an RFP for a Grants Administration Firm. We have also developed a survey to ask our Grantees and those who participated in the Community Grants for feedback regarding the process.

Performance Evaluation (Rodriguez)

We have most of the records from the Commander applicants. The community had alerted us to the possibility of these candidates being named in lawsuits in the past. The CPC has requested those records, but the process to review those records is still being developed.

Police Policy Committee (van Lier)

There is a upcoming community meeting about Police Surveillance Technology on May 30th, and there is an accompanying survey on that topic if people would like to take it.

Outreach Committee (Kennedy)

We are putting together an RFQ for a community satisfaction survey.

Rules Committee (van Lier)

The Rules Committee is coordinating with the Accountability Committee to create the CPC Evidentiary Hearing Manual.

Police Training Committee (Donaldson)

The Police Training Committee met on May 8th and approved the Dispatch Instructor Manual. Other training reviews will be coming up, included integrated reality-based training, trauma informed training, and a State mandated CPT lesson plan.

Donaldson moved to approve the Dispatch Instructor Manual, Benito seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – aye
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – absent
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – absent
- Ridgeway – absent
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – abstain
- Zayed – aye

The motion passed, 8-0-1.

Ad Hoc Hiring Committee (ED) (Wang)

The Committee was not able to meet this month.

Ad Hoc Outside Council Committee (Wang)

There was a discussion about the CPC's course of action when it receives advice from the outside council.

New Business

Kennedy moved to remove Kennedy from the Accountability Committee, Benito seconded.

- Adams – aye
- Benito – aye
- Chura – aye
- Donaldson – aye
- Earley – absent
- Garrett-Ferguson – absent
- Kennedy – aye
- Reaves – absent
- Ridgeway – absent
- Rodriguez – aye
- van Lier – aye
- Wang – abstain
- Zayed – aye

The motion passed, 8-0-1.

van Lier moved to censure Commissioner Garrett-Ferguson, Benito seconded.

There was an extensive discussion about why and how the CPC should hold its commissioners accountable. There was an discussion about Commissioner Garrett-Ferguson's conduct.

- **Adams – aye**
- **Benito – aye**
- **Chura – abstain**
- **Donaldson – abstain**
- **Earley – absent**
- **Garrett-Ferguson – absent**
- **Kennedy – aye**
- **Reaves – absent**
- **Ridgeway – absent**
- **Rodriguez – no**
- **van Lier – aye**
- **Wang – no**
- **Zayed – aye**

The motion carried, 5-2-2.

van Lier moved to censure Commissioner Wang and remove her from her committee assignments until the investigation against her has been resolved, Benito seconded.

There was an extensive discussion about why and how the CPC should hold its commissioners accountable. There was an extensive discussion about Commissioner Wang's conduct.

- **Adams – Aye**
- **Benito – aye**
- **Chura – abstain**
- **Donaldson – aye**
- **Earley – absent**
- **Garrett-Ferguson – absent**
- **Kennedy – aye**
- **Reaves – absent**
- **Ridgeway – absent**
- **Rodriguez – abstain**
- **van Lier – aye**
- **Wang – nay**

- **Zayed – aye**

The motion passed, 6-1-2.

Wang attempted to bring up a motion regarding the records in the Tolbert Case, this was ruled out of order by the Co-chairs as it was redundant. Wang moved to challenge the Co-chair's ruling, but was not seconded.

Wang moved to add herself, Commissioner Chura, and Mark Wallach to DOJ Status Conference meetings; this was not seconded.

Zayed moved to Adjourn, Kennedy seconded. Approved by unanimous consent.